

**GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**Tuesday, April 4, 2017  
4:00 p.m.**

**German Village Meeting Haus – 588 S. Third Street**

**Commissioners Present:** Charissa W. Durst, Anthony Hartke, Brett Leukart, Mark Ours, James Panzer, Ned Thiell

**Commissioners Absent:**

**City Staff Present:** Connie Torbeck

**German Village Society Staff Present:** Nancy Kotting

- I.** CALL TO ORDER – 4:04 p.m.
- II.** NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, April 25 2017 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Conference Room A.
- III.** NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, May 2, 2017 – 588 South Third Street
- IV.** SWEARING IN OF STAFF
- V.** INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI.** APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Tuesday, March 7, 2016.  
MOTION: Ours/Hartke (6-0-0) APPROVED
- VII.** STAFF APPROVALS – The German Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.  
MOTION: Thiell/Hartke (6-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII.** PUBLIC FORUM
- IX.** APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

**STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

**1. 17-4-14a**

**911 City Park Avenue**

**Bello Giardino Landscaping (Applicant)**

**Michael Horning & Brian Rambo (Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-4-14a, 911 City Park Avenue, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

**Relay Brick Sidewalk**

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, brick public sidewalks, per the submitted site plan, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new or used brick in the same location, per the submitted site plan.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.





- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

Remove Brick Sidewalk & Install Plantings

- Remove a planting bed area of brick sidewalk adjacent to the street and curb.
- Setback of the planting bed from the existing curb to match the neighboring planting bed to the south.
- Install new plantings, per the submitted landscape plan.

MOTION: Ours/Hartke (6-0-0) APPROVED

**HOLDOVERS**

**2. 17-3-19**

**578 South Sixth Street**

**Paul & Heather doForno (Applicants/Owners)**

*Following presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicants, continue Application # 17-3-19, 578 South Sixth Street, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the May 2, 2017 German Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Ours/Hartke (6-0-0) CONTINUED

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**3. 17-4-15**

**780 Jaeger Street**

**Shawn McNeil (Applicant)**

**Mitchell & Debra Janklow (Owners)**

*This application was withdrawn by the Applicant via email on April 4, 2017.*

Front Porch

- Remove the existing, wood deck framing and wood flooring of the existing front elevation porch.
- Build a new, split-face block foundation and install new, concrete deck.

Side Porch

- Remove the existing, wood deck framing and wood flooring of the existing south elevation porch.
- Build a new, split-face block foundation and install new, concrete deck.

APPLICATION WITHDRAWN

NO ACTION REQUIRED

**4. 17-4-16**

**835 South Fifth Street**

**Thomas P. Pappas (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-4-16, 835 South Fifth Street, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove Concrete Porch Foundation

- Remove the existing, non-original, non-contributing, full-width, concrete porch foundation and deck on the front elevation.
- Install new, limestone steps at front entrance, per the submitted example photograph.
- Install new landscaping in front yard, per the submitted site plan and plantings list.

Repair Existing Brick Wall

- Repair portions of the existing, failing brick wall along the front property line, as needed.
- Remove any/all damaged brick and replace with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.



- Moistening surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).
- The height, thickness, and length of the masonry wall is to remain the same following the completion of all repairs.
- Removal of the entire wall and rebuilding with new brick is not approved at this time.
- Complete rebuilding of the wall with new brick requires a new application and review by the German Village Commission.

Install New Door/South Elevation

- Remove the existing, wood, six-panel, side entrance door on the main block of the house.
- Install new, three-quarter light, wood door, to match the existing front door.
- Cut sheet for new door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

MOTION: Ours/Hartke (6-0-0) APPROVED

**5. 17-4-17**

**123 East Deshler Avenue**

**Danielle Maclellan/GBR Masonry, Inc. (Applicant)**

**Steve Schillinger (Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Continue Application # 17-4-17, 123 East Deshler Avenue, for installation of brick veneer on the rear addition, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the May 2, 2017 German Village Commission agenda for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

- If brick veneer is found to be appropriate, it should not look like "old brick." There should not be an attempt to create a false history.
- Need to consider how the addition could be clad with brick and still be modest and subservient to the main block of the historic house.
- Thin brick has not typically been approved by the Commission in the past, except in cases with special circumstances.
- The applicant should provide drawings including jamb details and sections of the proposed sills and lintels.

MOTION: Ours/Hartke (6-0-0) CONTINUED

**6. 17-4-18**

**33 East Deshler Avenue**

**Kevin Hock (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-4-18, 33 East Deshler Avenue, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Retaining Wall

- Build a new, retaining wall adjacent to the existing public sidewalk, along Pearl Street, in the location of the existing, low, concrete footer, and returning along the driveway, toward the garage, per the submitted site plan.
- New wall may be built on the existing, low, concrete footer, or the footer may be removed.
- The existing, block of concrete returning toward the garage is to be removed.
- Section of new wall along driveway may also return at the existing, concrete steps.



- New wall material to be stone, per the submitted photograph. Cut sheet for new stone to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
  - Height of new retaining wall to be 12-inches (+/-) above the existing sidewalk.
- MOTION: Ours/Hartke (6-0-0) APPROVED

*Agenda Item # 8 was reviewed following Agenda Item # 6.*

**7. 17-4-19**

**210 Thurman Avenue**

**Jeff Excell (Applicant)**

**Micha Bitton (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application #17-4-19, Commissioner Ours noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room. Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-4-19, 210 Thurman Avenue, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Windows

- Remove the existing, 2011, aluminum storefront windows.
- Install new, steel storefront windows, per the submitted drawings.
- Operable sections of storefronts are to be in-swinging, hopper windows.

Create New Door Opening

- Create a new door opening on the east elevation.
- New door opening to be located no less than six feet (6') back from the façade of the building.
- New door to be recessed as much as practical.
- Revised drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- New door to be a full-light, hollow metal door. Door cut sheet to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

MOTION: Hartke/Durst (3-2 [Panzer – Durst/against]-1 [Ours/abstain]) APPROVED

*Agenda Item # 9 was reviewed following Agenda Item # 7.*

**8. 17-4-20**

**247 East Beck Street**

**Todd A. Schmidt/Renovations Unlimited (Applicant)**

**Jeff & Sara McNealey (Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-4-20, 247 East Beck Street, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Demolition

- Demolish the existing, ca. 1985, rear, one-story, open porch, per the submitted photographs.

New Addition

- Construct a new, one-story, rear addition, per the submitted drawings.
- Any remnants/ghosting of existing shed roof to be covered by new shed roof.
- Exterior cladding to be wood, horizontal siding.
- Foundation to be split-face block.
- All existing, masonry openings on rear of main house to remain when removing existing doors, window, and door and window frames.
- East elevation to include two, horizontal, awning type windows. Drawings to be revised with the two windows moved closer together.
- West elevation to include no windows.
- Rear steps to be concrete.



- Applicant has the option to install new chair lift at rear steps, or to install a new accessible ramp. Metal railings at steps to be submitted to staff.
- Install new brick walk and blue stone on concrete ramp, with CMU walls, between rear steps of house and garage, per the submitted site plan.
- Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office stamp for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Cut sheets for new windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office stamp for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: Aluminum-clad windows may be used on the new addition because the addition is detailed like a porch and is not visible from a public right-of-way.

MOTION: Ours/Hartke (6-0-0) APPROVED

*Agenda Item # 7 was reviewed following Agenda Item # 8.*

**9. 17-4-22**

**193 East Beck Street**

**Gauer Construction, Inc. (Applicant)**

**Susan Sutherland (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application #17-4-22, Commissioner Ours returned to the table. Following the presentation by the Applicants, Chairman Panzer called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slips received.*

<u><b>Name, Address, Affiliation:</b></u>	<u><b>Issues/ Comments:</b></u>
Brian Santin 578 South Fifth Street Neighboring Resident	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Expressed concern regarding the increased height of the garage.</li> <li>• Due to close proximity, has concerns about the owner's ability to maintain the garage without use of Santin's land for a ladder of scaffolding.</li> <li>• Would like to have a maintenance easement between the two property owners.</li> </ul>

*Following the public speaker(s), further presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-4-22, 193 East Beck Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Modify Previous Approval/New Garage

- Retain the existing garage, at a height of approximately 11'-6".
- Originally approved height was to be 11'-0".

*Note: The Commission noted that the original review and approval focused on the distance between the existing house and new garage rather than height, and that a difference between the drawn height of a building and the actual built height of +/- 6-inches is not uncommon.*

MOTION: Ours/Hartke (6-0-0) APPROVED



## **CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**

### **10. 17-4-23**

**802-804 South Sixth Street**

**George Simpson (Applicant)**

**Sixth Street, LLC. (Owners)**

*An application for a three-car garage was conceptually reviewed at the March 7, 2017 GVC hearing. Applicant has consulted with Zoning Department staff. Applicant will submit final drawings for review at the May 2, 2017 German Village Commission hearing.*

#### **Construct New Garage**

- Construct a new, 576 sq. ft., two-car garage on rear of lot.
- Each unit to be 12' W x 24' D, with 9' W x 7'H overhead doors.
- Pedestrian doors to be located on west and north elevations.
- Exterior cladding to be wood siding.
- Two coach lights to be located on west elevation and two on east elevation.
- Three (3) trees to be removed for new construction.
- Install new, concrete apron at alley.
- Install new, concrete sidewalk west side of new garage.

**NO ACTION TAKEN**

### **11. 17-3-26**

**700 Mohawk Street**

**Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)**

**Art & Natalia Rola (Owners)**

*This application was conceptually reviewed March 7, 2017. Revised elevation drawings have been submitted.*

#### **New Addition**

- Modify existing rear addition, and build a new, one-story addition at rear of existing, 1.5 story, brick cottage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be: Option C) Boral sheet panel (or exterior MDO or smooth plywood) with trim applied overtop; Option D) Board & Batten; 3) Stucco.
- Windows to be two-over-two, double-hung sash.
- Door on rear/west elevation to be multi-light.

#### **Exterior Alterations/Existing House**

- Modify fenestration on south side of existing house, per the submitted elevation drawings.
- Add door opening on south elevation.
- Apply new Thin Brick over existing concrete block south elevation.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.*

#### **Commissioner Comments**

##### **Commissioner Durst:**

- Would prefer "Option C" for the new addition because of its simplicity.
- Asked if horizontal siding has been considered for the addition.

##### **Commissioner Thiell:**

- Stucco is difficult to maintain.
- Asked if the window heads would be raised to match the height of the openings on the facade.
- Also has concerns that using thin brick that doesn't match the original brick could end up looking like a bad restoration in 10 years.

##### **Commissioner Panzer:**

- In regard to doing a restoration, it would not be possible to exactly match the old brick on the south elevation of the original house.



- Thin brick has, in general, not been approved on historic structures.
- Consider other materials, such as Boral.

Commissioner Ours:

- Agrees that “C” is the best option for the new addition.
- It was noted at the March 7<sup>th</sup> GVC hearing that the proposed new openings for the south elevation of the original house would not be a restoration of what we think may or may not have been there.
- Asked if there will be enough relief to finish thin brick against the old brick, or will it be proud? That leading edge is the biggest concern. The corner with the façade would be the most visible.
- Not opposed to the direction of the proposal, but need details about the window jambs and the transition at the corner.
- The historic fabric of the south elevation is gone and is significantly altered. Thinks either a full restoration or something new and contrasting could be appropriate. But a full restoration would be difficult.
- The Applicant should do a photo study of proposed brick types/colors with the existing old brick.

Commissioner Leukart:

- Agrees that “C” is the best option for the new addition.

Commissioner Hartke:

- Also agrees that “C” is the best option for the addition.
- What if the vertical strip where the new brick meets the façade were considered as a transition, similar to guidelines used for additions, with some material transition from old brick to new brick? That transition could be a visual cue to separate the old from the new.
- Will need to consider the details of how the roof and fascia will be repaired where the non-historic chimney flue is being removed.
- Thinks a full restoration would be difficult to comply with current construction methodology.

*Following the presentation by the Applicants, Chairman Panzer called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slips received.*

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Nancy Kotting 588 South Third Street German Village Society H.P. Advocate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Asked why the Commission is approaching the south wall with the standards of an addition rather than a restoration to a period of significance.</li> <li>• Has concerns that in 20 years, the new proposal could look as awkward as the altered wall currently looks.</li> </ul>

NO ACTION TAKEN

**12. 17-4-24 (New Application)**

**179 East Deshler Avenue**

**William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)**

**Chip & Julie Burke (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application #17-4-24, Commissioner Ours noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings and exited the hearing room. Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-4-24, 179 East Deshler Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Modify Fenestration/East Elevation

- Alter the fenestration on the east elevation of the ca. 2000, two-story brick house, per the submitted elevation drawings.
- New windows to be all wood (interior/exterior), Marvin, one-over-one, double-hung sash, to match existing windows.
- Stone sills and lintels on new window openings to match existing.



- Brick, to match existing, to be toothed in where existing window openings removed.
- Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Cut sheet for new windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Reasons for Approval: 1) The house is a non-contributing 2000 building; 2) The existing brick is available to match the toothing in of the existing openings.

MOTION: Hartke/Durst (5-0-1[Ours]) APPROVED

**13. 17-4-25 (New Application)**

**799 South Third Street**

**William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)**

**Jon Knitter (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application #17-4-25, Commissioner Ours returned to the table.*

*Following presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-4-25, 799 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Modify Previous Approval/New Construction

- Change the foundation material of the new, single-family dwelling from poured concrete to split-face concrete block, "warm tone."
- Porch to have no more than three (3) courses exposed.
- Side elevations of house to have no more than two (2) courses exposed.
- Rear elevation of house to have no more than one (1) course exposed.
- Note: COA #17-4-25 modifies COA #15-1-22/February 3, 2015 and COA #16-5-32/May 3, 2016.

MOTION: Hartke/Durst (6-0-0) APPROVED

**14. 17-4-26 (Conceptual)**

**610 Mohawk Street**

**William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)**

**Joe & Kate Mikes (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application #17-4-26, Commissioner Thiell noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings and exited the hearing room.*

Demolish Rear Porch

- Demolish the existing, 8' x 22', open porch on the rear elevation, per the submitted photographs.

New Addition

- Build a new, one-story addition, approximately 14' x 20'.
- Addition to be largely enclosed with glass.
- Roof to be flat.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.*

Commissioner Comments

Commissioner Durst:

- The fact that the proposed addition is one story is enough of a contrast without the need for a connector.
- Would not be concerned about the solid fence continuing over the first window.

Commissioner Panzer:

- Need to first determine whether it is reasonable to remove the existing porch.
- Look at cutting down the overhang and/or changing the gutter location.
- Thinks it would be odd to have the solid fence continuing over the first window.
- Agrees that a connector is not needed.



Commissioner Ours:

- Based on the HPO site visit, it appears that more than 50% of the original fabric of the porch has been removed and replaced.
- Need to consider any shadow lines or ghosting that could remain on the brick wall upon removal of the existing shed roof and side panels.
- Need to consider the relationship of the existing fence to the proposed new addition, in particular, the solid fence butting up to a wall of glass.
- Does not think a connector is needed for this project.
- Would not see clerestory windows as an issue.

Commissioner Hartke:

- Look at the rhythm and height of the fence line as it meets the addition.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**15. 17-4-27 (Conceptual)**

**214 East Sycamore Street**

**William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)**

**William Mains & Brian Smith (Owners)**

*Prior to review of Application #17-4-27, Chairperson Panzer noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings and exited the hearing room. Commissioner Ours assumed the role of Chairperson. Commissioner Thiell returned to the table.*

New Carriage House

- Construct a new, frame carriage house, facing onto Lear Street, per the submitted site plan.
- Parking for four autos to be provided.
- Council variance for use required.
- Setback of 24 ft. required due to existing sewer line, per submitted site plan.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, acting Chairperson Ours opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.*

Commissioner Comments

Commissioner Ours:

- The location of the auto court is a problem from Lear Street. Understands why it is placed there, but breaking the street wall with that setback does not seem right.
- It may be considered a hardship if it is determined that an existing sewer cannot legally be built over and there is no option except to set the proposed building back from Lear Street.
- Thinks it is premature to discuss any details of a proposed carriage house until the sewer situation is figured out.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**16. 17-4-28 (Conceptual)**

**1140 South Fourth Street**

**Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock Architects (Applicant)**

**Lykens Companies (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application #17-4-28, Commissioners Ours and Thiell noted the need to recuse themselves from the proceedings, excused themselves from the remainder of the hearing, and left the building. This proposal encompasses the historic addresses of 1120-1144 South Fourth Street and 133-159 Thurman Avenue.*

New Single Family House

- Construct a new, single-family dwelling between the existing houses at 147 and 157 Thurman Avenue, per the submitted site plan.
- New dwelling to match the historic context of the neighborhood.

New Carriage Homes

- Construct three (3) new carriage homes at the rear of 147-159 Thurman Avenue, with parking on the first level, and apartments on the second level, per the submitted site plan.



New Apartment Building

- Construct a new, three-story, 36-unit apartment building, with parking on the first level, at the northeast corner of S. Fourth Street and Nursery Lane, per the submitted site plan.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.*

Commissioner Comments

Commissioner Panzer:

- There are some fundamental questions relating to placement of buildings and density on the property that are all tied together.
- Typically, where multiple historic houses exist along a street, the setback of any infill should be no closer to the street than what is average along the block, or should be behind the façade of the nearest contributing building.
- Look at the historic parcel lines when considering the amount of lot coverage that could be supported by the Commission. The structures need to have room to breathe.
- Does not see the current proposal as reasonable in terms of scale, density and parking, unless the Applicant can present a solution that is in keeping with the district guidelines in terms of mass, scale, details, lot coverage, etc.
- Understands the reuse of industrial buildings for residential units, but philosophically disagrees with new residential being built in an industrial scale and style in an R2-F neighborhood. It creates a false history.
- Any new construction needs to respond to the scale and massing of the existing historic structures.
- Need to consider that this proposal leaves a significant corner, that always had structures on it, as surface parking.
- Traditionally, parking has not been located on the principal façade.
- Sees the proposed height of the apartment building as an issue.
- Fourth and Thurman has always been an activated corner with a mix of commercial and residential.
- Sees a big difference between a monolithic facade and a connected series of buildings. Row houses are very different than an apartment block.
- Look at residential unit size throughout the district. Thinks the proposed range of unit sizes is outside the range of unit sizes found in the district. Under 1000 sf/unit is by far the exception rather than the rule. Thinks building smaller units is outside the historic development pattern of the district. It's not impossible to change that pattern, but it is a hurdle.
- Noted that some people are choosing to move from large suburban houses into smaller units in German Village.
- In reviewing new construction the Commission looks at massing, materials, and details. It may be possible to vary one or two of those elements, but not all three.
- The Commission appreciates that there is interest in developing these odd sorts of sites and the commitment it takes to enter into the review process.
- The Commission rarely supports more than 50% lot coverage.
- Consider that single-family home owners will likely want some open rear yard.
- Look at the corner of Thurman and Jaeger for massing cues.
- Noted that Beck Place has three floors but the top floor is stepped back.
- Look at the Sycamores porte cochere entrance into a courtyard. That may be an approach that could help access internal parking.

Commissioner Hartke:

- Does not see the scale of the proposed apartment building as compatible with the immediate vicinity of the property. The massing is overpowering compared to the buildings there currently.
- Will need to have more information regarding existing zoning.
- Will need to consider the characteristics of a single monolithic structure with a repetitive façade and the characteristics of having individuality throughout the façade of the building.
- Need to have a better understanding of the parking requirements for the existing Engine House Office in addition to any new construction.



Commissioner Durst:

- In general agreement with the comments of Commissioners Panzer and Hartke.
- Try to come back with the minimum number of units that would work for the developer.

*Following the presentation by the Applicants, Chairman Panzer called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slips received.*

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Nancy Kotting 588 South Third Street German Village Society H.P. Advocate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Understands a developer's need for density economically.</li> <li>• Historically, there were periods of time when density was an economic response in housing. Some homes were divided, and are now being turned back to single-family homes.</li> <li>• Makes sense to desire density here from a historic point of view. There is precedent for that pressure informing the design, but it may not come out as a big block.</li> <li>• There is also a need for affordable housing in the area. Building only large, single-family homes does not answer that need.</li> <li>• Wonders if building below grade could be a solution.</li> <li>• Could the massing/form of row houses be considered?</li> <li>• Has the Applicant considered retaining some of the existing buildings and incorporating them into the overall design as an adaptive reuse – something creative and desirable to that younger audience?</li> <li>• Would like to be able to document the existing buildings on behalf of the GV Society prior to demolition.</li> </ul>

NO ACTION TAKEN

STAFF APPROVALS

*(The following applicants are not required to attend)*

- **17-4-1**

**849 City Park Avenue**

**Robert Mullinax (Applicant)**

**Robert & Carol Mullinax (Owners)**

Approve Application #17-4-1, 849 City Park Avenue as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing, 6'H, dog-eared, wood privacy fence and gate on south side of patio, along Lansing Street, and the deteriorated, 6' H, dog-eared, wood privacy fence along the west side of the property behind the garage.
- Install new six-foot high (6' H), wood privacy fence and gate in the same locations.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), straight-cut (not dog-eared or stockade) wood fence, with finished side out facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), straight-cut (not dog-eared or stockade) wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.



- **17-4-2 [Ours]**

**216 Thurman Avenue**

**Natalia Lebedin/Gunzelman Architecture + Interiors (Applicant)**                      **Thurman Partners, LLC. (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-4-2, 216 Thurman Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install Light Fixtures

- Install three (3) new, gooseneck light fixtures above the storefront, per the submitted elevation drawing and product cut sheet.

- **17-4-3**

**795 City Park Avenue**

**Bonnie Jones (Applicant)**

**Bonnie & Terry Jones (Owners)**

Approve Application #17-4-3, 795 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Siding/Trim Repair & Painting (Rear Porch)

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood siding and trim elements on the rear, second-story, enclosed porch (sleeping porch), as needed. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the sleeping porch for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color to match existing.

Tuck Pointing & Porch Repair

- Remove all non-original, and inappropriate mortar from the brick front porch with the appropriate hand tools to a depth of no less than one inch (1").
- Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

Repair Slate Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate on the main roof and dormers with new or used slate of the same color and profile, and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

- **17-4-4 [Panzer]**

**227 East Sycamore Street**

**Jennifer Williams (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-4-4, 227 East Sycamore Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install Radon Mitigation System

- Install new radon mitigation system on the west elevation of the rear, frame section of the house, per the submitted site plan and photographs.
- The exhaust piping is to be painted to match the siding color on the house, to blend in visually with the building surface as much as possible.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards, and all applicable City Building Codes



• **17-4-5**

**339 East Beck Street**

**John Chmielewski/Lowes (Applicant)**

**Jackson Pulliam (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-4-5, 339 East Beck Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof and porch roof of the house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new dimensional asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be Certain Teed, Carriage House (dimensional), "Stone Gate Gray."
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Remove existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and install new, half-round gutter system on all elevations.
- Install new, round, metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage. Color to be "Tuxedo Gray."
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **17-4-6**

**193 East Beck Street**

**Susan Sutherland (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-4-6, 193 East Beck Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Exterior Painting – House & Garage

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the garage and the previously painted, stucco house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color scheme to be as follows: Body – Benjamin Moore, HC-110, "Wethersfield Moss"; Windows/Trim – Benjamin Moore, 2137-30, "Durango."
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, foundation, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for



final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

• **17-4-7**

**499 City Park Avenue**

**Able Roof (Applicant)**

**Michael & Julia Harris (Owners)**

Approve Application #17-4-7, 499 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the rear, flat portion of the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color to match existing.

• **17-4-8**

**628 City Park Avenue**

**Bello Giardino Landscaping (Applicant)**

**Mark Shuter (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-4-8, 628 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing wood and lattice privacy fence along the north and east sides of the rear yard, and install a new six-feet high (6' H), wood privacy fence in the same location, per the submitted site plan.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts, per the submitted example photo.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

• **17-4-9**

**643 South Fifth Street**

**Bello Giardino Landscaping (Applicant)**

**Eric Vanderson (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-4-9, 643 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Repair/Replace Brick Sidewalk

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, brick, public and service sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new Belcrest #760, red brick pavers, in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.



- **17-4-10**

**796 South Fifth Street**

**Scott Motley & Martha Brewer Motley (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-4-10, 796 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on the main house, and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile, per the submitted specifications.
- Remove two-three rows of slate, as necessary for gutter repairs. Reinstall existing, intact slate upon final repair of box gutters, or replace with new slate to match existing slate exactly, like-for-like.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffits and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood siding and/or trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood siding and/or trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to match existing. Paint color chips for body, trim, and shutters to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff. Two south-facing doors to be painted Valspar (1009-4), "Cut Ruby" or Valspar (1011-3) "Quite Red."
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, foundation, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Remove Existing Sidewalk & Steps and Install New Sidewalk& Steps

- Remove the existing, concrete service sidewalk and front entry steps, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new brick paver sidewalk and brick front entry steps in the same location and of the same dimension.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

Install Stair Handrail

- Install a new black metal handrail at the front entrance, in accordance with all applicable Columbus Building Codes **[Note: Plumbers pipe with a combination of street and conventional 90's is not appropriate and is not approved for use on this site.]** Style of rails to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Install black pipe with malleable, adjustable fittings. Pipe diameter to be 1"-1 1/4" only; b) Install a one-piece, black, tubular steel rail & post unit. Tube diameter to be 1"- 1 1/4" only; c) Install a manufactured rail system per Fortin Welding & Mfg. Inc. (or like manufacturer) Model RSS.

Tree Removal

- Remove the existing, dying tree in the side yard.



- Tree removal to be done in accordance with standard industry practices to insure the safety of all neighboring properties and any/all workers involved.
- Remove the stump below grade to prevent new growth
- Haul away all debris.
- A new tree is to be planted within the same general area as the tree that has been removed.
- The species of the new tree to be chosen by Applicant.
- Applicant/Owner is to submit the choice of tree species to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the German Village Commission, prior to the planting of the new tree.

- **17-4-11**

**907 South Third Street**

**Brent Hammer (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-4-11, 907 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Remove and Relay Brick Sidewalk

- Remove sections of existing, brick, public sidewalk, as needed, to make required water line repairs.
- Relay the existing brick in the exact same location, upon completion of water line repairs.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

- **17-4-12**

**475 South Third Street**

**German Village Garten Club (Applicant)**

**Katzinger Deli (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-4-12, 475 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Temporary Banner

- Install one (1) new, temporary banner on the north, exterior wall of the Katzinger Delicatessen building.
- Banner to measure approximately 3.5' high x 8' wide.
- Temporary banner to promote the annual, "German Village Garten Club, GartenMarkt," per the submitted drawing.
- Temporary sign to be in place from approximately April 14, 2017 through May 7, 2017.
- Sign to be mounted with rope attached to existing anchors.

- **17-4-13**

**197 Thurman Avenue**

**Monica McFarland/Capital City Awning (Applicant)**

**David Catte (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-4-13, 197 Thurman Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install New Awnings

- Remove the one (1) existing, green, canvas awning on the façade and the three (3) existing, green, canvas awnings on the side elevation.
- Install four (4) new, black canvas awnings on the existing frames, per the submitted rendering.
- New awning on the façade to include the address number, "197."
- Any new signage to return for review and approval by the German Village Commission.

- **17-4-14**

**911 City Park Avenue**

**Bello Giardino Landscaping (Applicant)**

**Michael Horning & Brian Rambo (Owner)**

*Application #17-4-14 has been divided into item 'a' for German Village Commission review under Staff Recommendations (see above), and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.*

Approve Application #17-4-14, 911 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.



Landscape Plan

- Install new patio in the fenced rear yard, adjacent to the existing garage, per the submitted site plan and materials samples.
- Install new, 30" high, 8' long, Indiana limestone seat wall adjacent to patio, per the submitted site plan and materials samples.
- Install new plantings, per the submitted landscape plan.

- **17-4-21 [Ours]**

**157 East Deshler Avenue**

**Albert Unetic Architect (Applicant)**

**Brian House (Owner)**

*A new rear porch, portico, and carriage house were approved October 30, 2007 (COA #07-9-8b). Only the rear porch has been built. Construction of a portico is postponed. Garden wall to be omitted. Council Variance CV07-016 remains current.*

Approve Application #17-4-21, 157 East Deshler Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Renew Previous Approval/Carriage House

- Construct a new carriage house, as previously approved, per the submitted drawings, resubmitted 3/16//2017
- Exterior cladding to be brick veneer.
- Roofing material to be standing-seam-metal.
- Foundation to be CMU.
- Windows to have cut limestone sills and lintels.
- Cut sheet for windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Custom, wood garage doors to have cut limestone lintels.
- Cut sheet or detail drawing for wood doors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

**X. OLD BUSINESS**

**XI. NEW BUSINESS**

- **17-4-29**

**649 Mohawk Street**

**Elliot Hilaman (Applicant)**

**Annette P. Hilaman (Owner)**

*Following presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-4-29, 649 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove Chimney to Roofline/Garage

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, brick chimney on the rear elevation of the ca. 1968 garage, down to the roofline.
- Chimney structure below roofline to remain in place.

Reason(s) for Approval

The ca. 1968 garage is a non-historic, non-contributing building.

MOTION: Hartke/Durst (4-0-0) APPROVED

**XII. ADJOURNMENT**

MOTION: ADJOURNED (8:35 p.m.)